



NATIONAL HIGHWAY AUTHORITY

Procurement & Contract Administration Section
28-Mauve Area, G-9/1, Islamabad Tel: 9032727, Fax: 9260419

No. 6(604)/GM/(P&CA)/NHA/2024/470

Islamabad, 15th November, 2024

DIRECTOR GENERAL

PUBLIC PROCUREMENT REGULATORY AUTHORITY
1ST FLOOR FBC BUILDING NEAR STATE BANK,
SECTOR G-5/2, **ISLAMABAD.**

**SUBJECT: ANNOUNCEMENT OF FINAL EVALUATION REPORT (PPRA RULE-35):
CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR DESIGN REVIEW & CONSTRUCTION
SUPERVISION OF CONSTRUCTION OF YARIK-TANK ROAD (LENGTH:35 KM)
(D.I.KHAN ROAD DEVELOPMENT PACKAGE)**

Reference: PPRA Rule-35

Find enclosed herewith the Technical Final Evaluation Report along with Evaluation Criteria (Annex-I) for the subject services in line with PPRA Rule-35 for uploading on PPRA website at the earliest, please.

(FAYYAZ AHMED)

GENERAL MANAGER (P&CA)

DISTRIBUTION:

ENCL: Evaluation Report along with **Annex- I**

COPY TO:

- Member (Planning), NHA, Islamabad;
- Dy. Director (P&CA), NHA, Islamabad.



FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

1.	Name of Procuring Agency:	National Highway Authority
2.	Method of Procurement:	Single Stage Two Envelope Procedure
3.	Title of Procurement:	Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Construction of Yarik-Tank Road (Length:35 Km) (D.I Khan Road Development Package)
4.	Tender Inquiry No.:	6(604)
5.	PPRA Ref. No. (TSE):	TS538343E
6.	Date & Time of Bid Closing:	27 th May, 2024 at 1130 hours local time
7.	Date & Time of Bid Opening:	27 th May, 2024 at 1200 hours local time
8.	No of Bids Received:	Nine (09) Proposals were received
9.	Criteria for Bid Evaluation:	Criteria of Bid Evaluation is attached at Annex-I
10.	Details of Bid(s) Evaluation:	As below

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
1) M/s Associated Consulting Engineering (ACE) Ltd. in JV with M/s Zeeruk International Consultants and in association with M/s Hadi Engg Consultants (Sub-Consultant)	630	186	816	122,943,707	Top scoring firm in combined evaluation (PPRA Rule 36(b) (ix))
2) M/s CAMEOS in JV with M/s Indus Associated Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s Engineering General Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd., M/s Power Aim Engineering & in association with M/s Eco Vista (sub-Consultant)	581	200	781	114,442,450	2 nd

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Construction of Yarik-Tank Road (Length:35 Km) (D.I Khan Road Development Package)



FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
3) M/s PAVRON in association with M/s Karakoram Engineers (Sub-Consultant)	586	Non-Responsive Data Sheet of the RFP, ITC Clause 20.1 (II) (viii)			
4) M/s Development Management Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s Roghani Associates (Sub-Consultant)	582	Non-Responsive Data Sheet of the RFP, ITC Clause 20.1 (II) (viii)			
5) M/s Creative Engineering Consultants in JV with M/s Asif Ali Associates (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association with M/s Creative Structural Engineering Consultants (Sub-Consultant)	580	Non-Responsive As per Data Sheet of the RFP, ITC Clause 20.1 (II) (viii) & (III)			
6) M/s Techno Consult International (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s HA ENG CON International (Sub-Consultant)	566	Non-Responsive Data Sheet of the RFP, ITC Clause 20.1 (II) (vii & viii)			
7) M/s PEAS Consulting (Pvt.) Ltd. in association with M/s Manzoor Ahmad Arbab Associates Engineering & Technical Associates (MAA) (Sub-Consultant)	550 Dis-Qualified	Financial Proposal was not Opened			
8) M/s Osmani & Company (Pvt.) Ltd. in JV with M/s BK Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. and in association	Non-Responsive	Financial Proposal was not Opened			

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Construction of Yarik-Tank Road (Length:35 Km) (D.I Khan Road Development Package))



FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004)

Name of Bidder	Marks			Evaluated Cost (EC)* (PKR)	Rule/Regulation/ SBD**/Policy/ Basis for Rejection / Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004.
	Technical Score (St) (80%)	Financial Score (Sf) (20 %)	Total Score (100%)		
with M/s Soil & Structure Consulting Pakistan (Sub-Consultant)					
9) M/s Techno Legal Consultant (TLC) in association with M/s TUMAS (Sub-Consultant)	Non-Responsive				Financial Proposal was not Opened

*EC is the Evaluated Cost used for evaluation purpose and includes only the cost of competitive component (i.e. Remuneration and Direct Non-Salary Cost) and is exclusive of Provisional Sum, Contingency and Indirect Taxes.

Most Advantageous Consultant: M/s Associated Consulting Engineering (ACE) Ltd. in JV with M/s Zeeruk International Consultants and in association with M/s Hadi Engg Consultants (Sub-Consultant)

11. **Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share:** The Procurement was carried out in line with PPRA Rules & Regulations. The bidding was done on QCBS method with 80:20 Technical to Financial Proposals ratio. The Contract is being awarded to M/s Associated Consulting Engineering (ACE) Ltd. in JV with M/s Zeeruk International Consultants and in association with M/s Hadi Engg Consultants (Sub-Consultant) at evaluated Consultancy Cost of Pak. Rs. 141,320,193/- which includes Salary Cost, Direct Non-Salary Cost and all applicable Federal, Provincial and Local taxes including GST.

Signature: 

**General Manager (P&CA)
National Highway Authority
Islamabad**

Official Stamp: 

****Standard Bidding Documents (SBD).**

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision of Yarik-Tank Road (Length:35 Km) (D.I Khan Road Development Package))



National Highway Authority



Annex-I

Criteria

FOR

Final Evaluation

**CONSULTANCY SERVICES FOR DESIGN
REVIEW & CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION
FOR CONSTRUCTION OF YARIK-TANK
ROAD (LENGTH:35 KM) (D.I KHAN ROAD
DEVELOPMENT PACKAGE)**

November, 2024

SUMMARY EVALUATION SHEET FOR FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSALS (FTP)

EVALUATION CRITERIA	Max. Weightage	Firm 1		Firm 2	
		Rating	Score	Rating	Score
1. Firms Experience	100				
1-a. General Experience in road Transport Sector	25				
1-b. Specific Experience related to particular Assignment	75				
2. Approach and Methodology	250				
2-a. Appreciation of the Project	70				
(i) Evidence of Site Visit with Photographs giving a clear understanding/ proof of the project site	(30)				
(ii) Clarity of appreciation	(20)				
(iii) Comprehensiveness of appreciation	(20)				
2-b. Problem Statement/ understanding of objectives	50				
(i) Identification of Problems/ Objectives	(30)				
(ii) Components of Proposed Services	(20)				
2-c. Methodology	80				
(i) Proposed Solutions for this Project	(30)				
(ii) Quality of Methodology	(20)				
(iii) Conciseness, clarity and completeness of proposal	(30)				
2-d. Suggested Changes for Improvement in TOR	10				
2-e. Work Program	20				
2-f. Staffing Schedule	20				
3. Key Personnel	450				
Firm affidavit for presence of personnel	25				
a- Design Review (Key-Staff)	70				
i. Team Leader (Engineer)	70				
b- Construction Supervision (Key-Staff)	355				
i. Resident Engineer	90				
ii. Material Engineer	45				
iii. Contract Specialist (Intermittent Basis)	40				
iv. Environmental Specialist (Intermittent Basis)	30				
v. ARE (Highways)	60				
vi. ARE (Structure)	60				
vii. Senior Quantity Surveyor	30				
4. Performance Certification from clients	75				
Affidavit on stamp paper duly attested by the Oath Commissioner regarding non-blacklisting	25				
5. Present Commitments (current engagement and available strength – justification)	50				
6. Transfer of Knowledge (Methodology/ Plans)	50				
TOTAL:	1000				

Excellent - 100% Very Good - 90-99% Above Average – 80-89% Average – 70-79% Below Average – 1-69% Non-complying – 0%

Score: Maximum Weightage x rating / 100. Minimum qualifying score is 70% or 700 marks.

Consultancy Services for Design Review & Construction Supervision for Construction of Yarik - Tank Road (Length: 35 Km) (D.I Khan Road Development Package)



PERSONNEL EVALUATION SHEET

POSITION / AREA OF EXPERTISE	Name	Academic and General Qualification Weightage 30%		Project related Experience Weightage 60% for [Design Review] and 65% for [Construction Supervision]		Status with the Firm ** 10% for [Design Review] and 05% for [Construction Supervision]		OVERALL RATING (Sum of Weighted Ratings) (A+B+C)
		Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (A)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (B)	Percentage Rating	Weighted Rating (C)	
(Show all experts to be evaluated)								
Design Review Team								
i. Team Leader (Engineer)								
Construction Supervision (Key-Staff)								
i. Resident Engineer								
ii. Material Engineer								
iii. Contract Specialist (Intermittent Basis)								
iv. Environmental Specialist (Intermittent Basis)								
v. ARE (Highways)								
vi. ARE (Structure)								
vii. Senior Quantity Surveyor								

Rating: - Excellent - 100% Very good – 90-99% Above Average – 80-89% Average – 70-79% Below Average – 1-69%
 Non-complying - 0%

Score: Maximum Weightage X rating / 100.

* For Qualification and Experience of above Key Personnel, refer to TOR Chapter 5, Clause -5.6 (Qualification and Experience Requirement of Personnel).

** 6 month's older employee - 100%;
 Less than 6 months or associates-0% (For more than six months, salary account certificate from employer duly attested by respective bank shall be attached with the proposal.

